

Clarifications on Pre-bid queries concerning RFP for Selection of Consultant for Preparation of Action Plan for Development of Cruise Tourism in India

IPA/MSD/ICTD/Cruise tourism/2016			RFP for Selection Consultant for preparation of Action Plan for development of cruise tourism in India.		Clarifications on Pre-Bid Queries	
Sr.	Reference Clause No.	Page No.	Clarification Particulars		Clarification Sought	Clarification Given
			Clause	Organization		
1.	3.5 (f)	12	Average annual turnover of the Bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy services (i.e., 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) shall be at least Rs. 50 crores.	Alia Consulting Solutions	Kindly reduce it to Rs. 5 crores , so that technically competent firms with lesser turnover can apply in this tender.	Not agreed
2.	3.5 (f)	12	Average annual turnover of the Bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy service (i.e., 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) shall be at least Rs. 50 crores.	AlphaMERS Ltd	We had carried out this study for an amount of Rs. 5 Lacs only. Noting the bid security amount, we feel the estimated cost of this study is close to Rs. 200 Lacs. This estimate has unnecessarily increased the PQC criteria very high. In our opinion a cumulative turnover of Rs. 50 Lacs in tourism related studies should suffice for the project. This will enable experienced Indian firms like us to participate who have done previous study on very tight budgets, but the report was much appreciated at that time.	Not agreed
			New Clause	AlphaMERS Ltd	The study should include the strategy to bring viable utilization of assets created. This is most important as market forces are unable to break the uneconomy of scale in this industry. This study must provide a strategy to come out of the vicious cycle of under	This aspect shall also be covered by the consultant.

					utilization of assets, low revenue leading to downward spiral of quality.	
3.	3.5.(f) Note:	12	condition (d) (e) and (f) shall be met by the Lead Member of the consortium individually, all other conditions i.e. (a), (b) and (c) shall be met by all members of consortium to qualify for further evaluation	CRISIL	We request that the lead member would meet the financial eligibility criteria. Given the experience required for the assignment, we request you to consider the experience of the consortium member along with the lead member.	Not agreed
	3.5 (d)	12	The bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 2 cr.	CRISIL	We feel that the eligibility criteria should concentrate more on the relevance of the projects than the consultancy fee. This would also ensure higher participation of bidders.	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 1 Cr.
	3.5 (e)	12	The bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for at least cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 cr.	CRISIL	Given that there are not many cruise tourism projects in India, we feel that the criteria related to consultancy fee value may be removed. In case of older assignments, how would the consultancy values be adjusted? Can cruise tourism projects also include inland waterways tourism projects or projects related to ports?	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr.
	3.6.(B).1.	14	Number of completed consultancy projects (compulsory submission of completion certificate along with the proposal)	CRISIL	We request that the copy of work order and contract be considered for the same purpose.	In case completion certificate is not there, other documentary evidence of having carried out the study with contact details of entity for which the study was carried out may be given for verification.

	3.10.(4)	16	Last Date of submission of RFP-29/06/2016	CRISIL	We request you to kindly extend the bid submission date by 1-2 weeks, so that we may submit a quality and value-for-money bid.	Last date extended to 11 th July, 2016.
	5.2 Deliverable 3	29	In addition to the above, a detailed assesement for Goa, Mumbai, Gujarat and Dubai circuit, Cochin-Colombo-Male and India-Srilanka-male- secyhelles circuits may also be carried out. Short listing of specific ports/terminal which would be needed to be developed at least 4 ports) for international cruise tourism in India.	CRISIL	Do we envisage any site visits for the detailed study of the circuits or identification of ports? If yes, we request you to kindly extend the timelines for the same as we feel that current timeline of D+2 months for the same might be insufficient. If site visits are required, shall the MoS facilitate required permissions in all areas?	Site visits may be required for port. Timeline required may be indicated while submitting the proposal and according to deployment of personnel may be indicated in Annexure 5(c) and 5(b) (page 57, 58 of RFP).
	5.5	32	The consultant shall submit quarterly progress reports during the project duration.	CRISIL	Considering the project period to be of 4 months, shall the quarterly progress report mean a monthly report? Is this in addition to the deliverables which are scheduled to be delivered every month?	Only monthly progress report are required to be provided.
	3.5.(d)	12	The bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 2 Cr.	CRISIL	We request the Authority to allow the Bidder to showcase at least three (3) completed tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 70 Lakhs	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 1 Cr.
	3.5.(e)	12	The bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.	CRISIL	We request the Authority to allow the Bidder to showcase experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 10 lakhs	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr.

	3.6.(B).1.	14	Submission of completion certificate along with the proposal	CRISIL	We request the Authority to kindly allow submission of Letter of Award in case completion Certificate is not available.	In case completion certificate is not there, other documentary evidence of having carried out the study with contact details of entity for which the study was carried out may be given for verification.
	3.10.4	16	Last Date of Submission of RFP-29/09/6/2016	CRISIL	We request the Authority to kindly extend the bid submission date by atleast 2 weeks post the date of issuance of pre-bid clarifications	Last date extended to 11 th July, 2016.
	5.4. Note:	31	In case of any delay form the above mentioned timelines, a penalty of 1% of stage payment per week shall be forfeited by the IPA/Ministry.	CRISIL	We request the Authority that this clause should be only for delays that are solely attributable to the consultants act or omissions. No damages will be paid in the event the delay occurs as a result of delay or actions or omissions of any other party which has direct or indirect impact on consultant's scope of work or time-lines.	The penalty will be for the delay caused due to consultant's act of omissions and commission.
4.	3.5 (d)	12	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 2 Cr.	DELOITTE	We would like to highlight that tourism and more specifically cruise tourism has gained interest in the last few years of India and is a nascent sector in terms of consultancy work. Stipulating a condition of minimum fee of INR 2 Cr. Would be highly restrictive and would adversely impact the competition.	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 1 Cr.
	3.5 (e)	12	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.	DELOITTE	It is thus requested that minimum fee threshold should be suitably reduced.	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr.
	3.5 (f)	12	Average annual turnover of the	DELOITTE	We would like to highlight that as	For year 2015-16 undertaking

			Bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy services (i.e., 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) shall be at least Rs. 50 Crores. A Certificate from a Chartered Account (As per format prescribed in Annexure 2) along with audited financial statements shall be furnished. (In case audited financial statements are not available for year 2015-16, an undertaking on the bidder's letterhead shall be submitted along with unaudited financials)				per applicable laws, the firm may finalize financial statements upto few months after the closure of its financial year. Also, it may not be possible to furnish the unaudited accounts at this stage. It is thus requested that in audited financial statements are not available for year 2015-16, undertaking on the bidder's letterhead or the auditor may suffice and annual statements for FY 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 may only be required to be submitted.	on the auditor's letterhead may suffice.														
	3.6.(B).1.	14	<table><tr><td>B</td><td colspan="3">Relevant Work Experience of the Firm</td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td colspan="2">Number of completed consultancy projects</td><td>Marks</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>(i)</td><td>Minimum 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee</td><td>5</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>(ii)</td><td>More than 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee</td><td>5</td></tr></table>	B	Relevant Work Experience of the Firm			1	Number of completed consultancy projects		Marks		(i)	Minimum 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee	5		(ii)	More than 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee	5	DELOITTE	Based on our understanding, these projects may not be limited to any particular sector. Please confirm our understanding.	They have to be in the sectors relevant to the scope of the work i.e. Tourism and Cruise Tourism.
B	Relevant Work Experience of the Firm																					
1	Number of completed consultancy projects		Marks																			
	(i)	Minimum 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee	5																			
	(ii)	More than 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee	5																			

3.6.B.1.	14	B Relevant Work Experience of the Firm			DELOITTE	Our understanding is that for the first 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. minimum consultancy fee, we will be awarded 5 marks. For any no. of projects greater than 3 and having INR 2 cr minimum consultancy fee, we will be awarded 10 marks. Please confirm our understanding.	For the first three projects relevancy of the project will be the criteria of assessment.	
		1	Number of completed consultancy projects					Marks
		(i)	Minimum 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee	5				
		(ii)	More than 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee	5				
3.5	13	In case of consortium, the Team Leader should be from the Lead Member. Further, the rest of the experts should be on the rolls of the sole member/ any of the consortium members. The consultant will estimate the requirement of support staff			DELOITTE	We would like to highlight that cruise tourism in India is in nascent stages and in order to field the most suitable expertise, the consultant may be required to associate with independent expert with extensive experience in the cruise tourism domain. It is thus requested that the referred condition may be waive.	Not agreed	
5.3	31	The scope of services specified in Clause 5.2 are not exhaustive and the Consultant shall undertake such other tasks as may be necessary for the preparation of action plan and detailed road map for development of cruise tourism in India			DELOITTE	We understand that scope of work covered under the referred Clause would be contingent decision of the client and would be subject of separate Terms of Reference. Please confirm our understanding. If so, kindly provide the mechanism for payment for the additional work	Details have been sought in Form 4 & 5 on page 71&72 of the RFP respectively to determine remuneration in case additional work is awarded.	

	6.3.7	41	The Consultant (a) shall take out and maintain, and shall cause any Sub Consultants to take out and maintain, at their (or the Sub-Consultants', as the case may be) own cost but on terms and conditions approved by the IPA/Ministry, insurance against the risks,	DELOITTE	We, as profession service firm, has already in place a firm-wide umbrella comprehensive insurance policy which shall be effective for the entire duration as specified in the RFP and also, the coverage shall be more than required under the RFP. It is thus requested that the existing insurances may be considered sufficient and the Consultant may not be required to procure any additional insurance Consultant's self-certified letter in this regard will suffice as proof of insurance	The Consultant shall take out and maintain, and shall cause any Sub Consultants to take out and maintain, at their (or the Sub-Consultants', as the case may be) own cost for insurance against the risks sufficient for the purpose of this engagement. Consultant's self-certified letter in this regard will suffice as proof of insurance
5.	3.4(b).(iv)	11	"Bidders whose bids meet eligibility and qualifications criteria of bidding documents as specified in point no. 5 and 6 of Bid Summary respectively and submitted required Tender Fee and Bid Security in accordance with point 9 of this Bid Summary"	EY	Referring to the point 9 of the bid summary, we understand that 'Bid security' of INR 2 Lakhs (refundable) is required to be submitted. There is no information provided for the 'Tender fees'. Request you to please clarify, if the amount specified includes Tender Fees as well.	It has to be separately provided. A self declaration will be sufficient.
	3.5(c)	11	"The Bidders shall not be under a declaration of ineligibility for corrupt and fraudulent practices by the Central Government, the State Government, Local Self Government"	EY	There is no specific format provided in the RFP. We understand, this can be submitted as a declaration by the bidder on its letterhead. Request to please clarify	
	3.5 (d), (e)	12	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 2 Cr. The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related	EY	There are markings on the number of projects in each category (d.e.) However, for bringing on board the current experience and value consultant has, it is suggested to consider on-going projects for evaluation. We also request to kindly revise the consultancy fees value to INR 1 crore.	Ongoing project where more than 50% of the work has been completed will also be considered. However, there weightage will be 50% of the completed project. The bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast

			project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.			cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr.
	3.6. B.1.	14	Compulsory submission of completion certificates	EY	<p>We request you to consider on-going project, which have similar scope of services for evaluating the technical competence of the organization.</p> <p>It is suggested to accept client contracts/work order as substantiating documents for the projects executed.</p>	<p>Ongoing project where more than 50% of the work has been completed will also be considered. However, there weightage will be 50% of the completed project.</p> <p>In case completion certificate is not there, other documentary evidence of having carried out the study with contact details of entity for which the study was carried out may be given for verification.</p>
	3.9	15	Bid Security (refundable) Rs. 2,00,000/- (Rupees Two Lakhs only) in the form of Demand Draft/Pay order/ Bank Guarantee from Nationalised or Scheduled Banks drawn in favor of Indian Ports Association” and payable at New Delhi	EY	As specified in the referred clause, we request client to provide the Bank Guarantee format.	There is no specific format.
	3.10.(4)	15	Last date of submission of RFP on 29 June, 2016 by 1500 hrs.	EY	Keeping in view the time required to finalize the Technical and Financial Proposal after receipt of the clarifications, it is recommended that a minimum period of 2 weeks to be given after issue of the Minutes /	Last date extended to 11 th July, 2016.

					Clarifications as there will be major modification in the proposal modality after minutes are issued to us.	
	4.20	25	The Bidders may participate in the Selection Process either individually (the “Sole Firm/Company”) or as a consortium of firms/ companies (the “Consortium”) in response to this invitation. A maximum of three members are allowed in the Consortium.	EY	<p>Considering the international experience and know-how at national level tourism study is sought in scope, we request you to allow 4 members to form consortium.</p> <p>The arrangement of the consortium can further managed in Joint venture/ association/ Sub-Consultancy.</p>	<p>Agreed</p> <p>Agreed</p>
	6.2.7. (b)	39	<p>The Consultant may terminate this Contract, by not less than thirty (30) days written notice to the IPA/Ministry, such notice to be given after the occurrence of any of the events specified in paragraphs (i) through (iii) of this Clause GC 6.2.7 (b):</p> <p>i) If the IPA/Ministry fails to pay any money due to the Consultant pursuant to this Contract and not subject to dispute pursuant to Clause GC 6.7 hereof within forty-five (45) days after receiving written notice from the Consultant that such payment is overdue.</p>	EY	<p>We suggest to please consider:</p> <p>The Consultant may terminate this Contract, by not less than thirty (30) days written notice to the IPA/Ministry, such notice to be given after the occurrence of any of the events specified in paragraphs (i) through (iii) of this Clause GC 6.2.7 (b):</p> <p>i) If the IPA/Ministry fails to pay any money due to the Consultant pursuant to this Contract and not subject to dispute pursuant to Clause GC 6.7 hereof within fifteen (15) days after receiving written notice from the Consultant that such payment is overdue.</p>	Not agreed

	6.3.7	41	The Consultant (a) shall take out and maintain, and shall cause any Sub Consultants to take out and maintain, at their (or the Sub-Consultants', as the case may be) own cost but on terms and conditions approved by the IPA/Ministry, insurance against the risks, and for the coverage, as shall be specified in the SC; and (b) at the IPA/Ministry's request, shall provide evidence to the IPA/Ministry showing that such insurance has been taken out and maintained and that the current premiums have been paid	EY	<p>We would like to clarify that, EY maintains professional indemnity insurance only. Such professional indemnity insurance cover for our professional business up to an appropriate level sufficient for the purposes of this engagement, and similar to that of the other large accountancy firms.</p> <p>We believe this will suffice.</p>	The Consultant shall take out and maintain, and shall cause any Sub Consultants to take out and maintain, at their (or the Sub-Consultants', as the case may be) own cost insurance against the risks sufficient for the purpose of this engagement.
--	-------	----	--	-----------	---	--

6.3.10.(a)	41	All plans, drawings, specifications, designs, reports, other documents and software submitted by the Consultant under this Contract shall become and remain the property of the IPA/Ministry, and the Consultant shall, not later than upon termination or expiration of this Contract, deliver all such documents to the IPA/Ministry, together with a detailed inventory thereof.	EY	<p>We suggest you to please consider:</p> <p>a) All plans, drawings, specifications, designs, reports, other documents and software submitted by the Consultant under this Contract shall become and remain the property of the IPA/Ministry, and the Consultant shall, not later than upon termination or expiration of this Contract, deliver all such documents to the IPA/Ministry, together with a detailed inventory thereof. The Consultant shall continue to retain all pre-existing intellectual property rights in all software, designs, utilities, tools, models, systems and other methodologies and know-how that the Consultant already owns or licenses ("Consultant Materials"), including improvements to such Consultant Materials or knowledge developed while performing the Services.</p>	Not agreed
6.3.11.(b)	42	"shall permit the "IPA/Ministry" or its designated representative during the subsistence of this contract, on advance service of ten(10)-days-notice by the IPA/Ministry, to inspect and make copies of the accounts thereof as well as to have them audited by auditors appointed by the IPA/Ministry, if so required by the Ministry as the case may be."	EY	<p>We request you to please consider:</p> <p>"shall permit the "IPA/Ministry" or its designated representative during the subsistence of this contract, on advance service of ten(10)-days-notice by the IPA/Ministry, to inspect and make copies of the accounts thereof as well as to have them audited by auditors appointed by the IPA/Ministry, if so required by the Ministry as the case may be." However, such audit shall be restricted to physical files only related to this Agreement and such</p>	Agreed

					auditor shall not be a competitor of the Consultant.	
	6.9	44	Consultant shall indemnify the IPA/Ministry and every members, officers and employees of the IPA/Ministry, against all actions, proceedings, claims, demands, costs and expenses whatsoever arising out of or, in connection with various matters and against all actions, proceedings, claims, demands, costs and expenses whatsoever arising out of any negligent act or omission or failure by consultants in the performance of Consultant's obligation under this Agreement.	EY	We request the client to cap the indemnity as 1 time liability	Not agreed

6.9	44	Consultant shall indemnify the IPA/Ministry and every members, officers and employees of the IPA/Ministry, against all actions, proceedings, claims, demands, costs and expenses whatsoever arising out of or, in connection with various matters and against all actions, proceedings, claims, demands, costs and expenses whatsoever arising out of any negligent act or omission or failure by consultants in the performance of Consultant's obligation under this Agreement.	EY	<p>We request you to please consider:</p> <p>Subject to the maximum limit of the fee received by the Consultant, Consultant shall indemnify the IPA/Ministry and every members, officers and employees of the IPA/Ministry, against all actions, proceedings, claims, demands, costs and expenses whatsoever arising out of or, in connection with various matters and against all actions, proceedings, claims, demands, costs and expenses whatsoever arising out of any negligent act or omission or failure by consultants in the performance of Consultant's obligation under this Agreement.</p>	Agreed
Annexure 2	52	Financial Capacity of the Applicant for the Financial years: 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16	EY	<p>Our audited financial statement for the year 2015-16 is not yet available. Hence, we request you to please consider: a) Unaudited and Provisional certificate for 2015-16; or</p> <p>b) Audited statement for the year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15</p> <p>Request for your kind consideration</p>	For year 2015-16 undertaking on the auditor's letterhead may suffice.
Annexure 4	54 - 56	Page limit for CVs and A&M	EY	It is suggested to clarify the page limitation for CV's and A&M, to bring uniformity in all the bids submitted for evaluation.	No specific limit is prescribed.
Annexure 5	58	Survey and Field Investigations	EY	We understand that survey and field investigation will be part of our proposed work plan, which will be covered under Approach and Methodology. Hence, its requested to modify Annex 5 to Work Schedule/Work Plan.	This has been deliberately kept separate and formats of Annexure 5(a) and 5(b) are different.

	Form F5	72	Breakdown of Reimbursable Expenses (i) Per diem allowance	EY	It is requested to fix the per diem fees. We understand, accommodation will not be part of per-diem. Please clarify.	No separate amount for accommodation will be provided.
			New Clause	EY	<p>We request you to please consider including a new clause:</p> <p>The IPA/Ministry shall not recover from the Consultant, in contract or tort, under statute or otherwise, any amount with respect to loss of profit, data or goodwill, or any other consequential, incidental, indirect, punitive, or special damages in connection with claims arising out of this Contract or otherwise relating to the services under the Contract, whether or not the likelihood of such loss or damage was contemplated.</p> <p>The IPA/Ministry shall not recover from the Consultant, in contract or tort, under statute or otherwise, aggregate damages in excess of the fees actually paid in connection with claims arising out of this Contract or otherwise relating to the services under the Contract. However, this limitation shall not apply to losses or damages caused by the Consultant's fraud or wilful misconduct or to the extent prohibited by applicable law or professional obligations.</p>	Not agreed

			New Clause	EY	<p>We request you to please consider including a new clause:</p> <p>Any information, advice, recommendations or other content of any reports, presentations or other communications we provide under this Agreement ("Reports"), other than IPA/Ministry's, are for IPA/Ministry's internal use only (consistent with the purpose of the particular Services) including IPA/Ministry's Board of directors, its audit committee, or its statutory auditors. The IPA/Ministry may not rely on any draft Report and the Consultant shall not be required to update its Final Report.</p>	Not agreed
			New Clause on Confidentiality	EY	<p>We request you to please consider including a new clause:</p> <p>Confidentiality: Except as otherwise permitted by this Contract, neither of the parties may disclose to third parties the contents of this Contract or any information/report/advice provided by or on behalf of the other that ought reasonably to be treated as confidential and/or proprietary. Parties may, however, disclose such confidential information to the extent that it: (a) is required for implementation of the purposes of this RFP; (b) is or becomes public other than through a breach of this Agreement, (c) is subsequently received by the receiving party from a third party who, to the receiving party's knowledge, owes no obligation of confidentiality to the</p>	Not agreed

					disclosing party with respect to that information, (d) was known to the receiving party at the time of disclosure or is thereafter created independently, (e) is disclosed as necessary to enforce the receiving party's rights under this Agreement, or (f) must be disclosed under applicable law, legal process or professional regulations. These obligations shall be valid for a period of 3 years from the date of termination of this Agreement.	
6.	3.5 (d)	12	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 2 Cr.	Grant Thornton	We request the authority to consider the following "The Bidder should have completed at least two (2) tourism related consultancy projects."	Not agreed
	3.5 (e)	12	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.	Grant Thornton	We request the authority to consider the following "The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast one cruise/ costal tourism project."	Not agreed
	3.5 (d)(e) and (f) Note:	12	condition (d)(e) and (f) shall be met by the Lead Member of the consortium individually, all other conditions i.e. (a), (b) and (c) shall be met by all members of consortium to qualify for further evaluation	Grant Thornton	We request you to consider "Condition of eligibility shall be met by bidder for further evaluation".	Not agreed
	3.5 (g).1.	12	Management Graduate (MBA) with	Grant	Request to consider the following	Not agreed

			minimum of 15 years of professional experience in tourism sector. Must have relevant experience in Coastal/ Cruise tourism, tourism circuit development with an Exposure of international assignments in similar domain.	Thornton	“Any graduate or post graduate with minimum of 15 years of professional experience in tourism sector. Must have relevant experience in Coastal/ Cruise tourism, tourism circuit development with an exposure of international assignments”	
7.	3.5 (d)	12	The bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 2 Cr.	IDFC	As per the Eligibility Criteria, the bidders should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related projects in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Crores. Moreover this criteria is to be met by the lead Member in case of Consortium.	The Bidder should have completed at least three (3) tourism related consultancy projects having minimum consultancy fee of INR 1 Cr.
	3.5 (e)	12	The bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for at least cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.	IDFC	We would like to mention that this kind of experience will largely be with very few international consultancy firms not based in India. Such international consultants will generally not intend to participate in a bid as a Lead Member owing to physical presence required by the Lead Member during consultancy period. We request you to kindly alter this clause to seek projects in cruise tourism sector with a cumulative fee of Rs. 50 Lakhs and such criteria to be met by any member of the consortium.	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr.

	3.5 (f)	12	Average annual turnover of the Bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy service (i.e., 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) shall be at least Rs. 50 crores.	IDFC	<p>As per the Eligibility criteria, the average turnover of the bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy services is sought to be Rs. 50 crores.</p> <p>We wish to mention that this kind of turnover is very large for a firm carrying out pure consultancy services. Also the cap of Rs. 50 crores will keep away many of the technically strong advisory firms with lesser turnover from participating in the bid. We request you to kindly reduce the average annual turnover of the bidder in the last three financial years to Rs. 10 crores from consultancy services.</p>	Not agreed
	3.5 (g).1	12	Management Graduate (MBA) with minimum of 15 years of professional experience in tourism sector. Minimum have relevant experience in Coastal/Cruise tourism, tourism circuit development with an Exposure of international assignments in similar domain.	IDFC	<p>With respect to the Key Experts proposed for the assignment, the Team Leader is proposed to be Coastal/Cruise Tourism Expert. In continuation to our query no. 2, in case of international consultancy firms participating in the bid, this expert may be an international expert and may not be able to travel frequently to attend meetings with IPA. In view of the same, we request you to kindly make the Financial Expert as the Team leader for the Project.</p>	Making financial expert as team leader cannot be agreed. The team leader has to be fully available for the assignment and should be available for all face to face meetings and regular interactions as may be decided.
	3.6.B.1	14	<p>Number of completed consultancy projects (compulsory submission of completion certificate along with the proposal)</p> <p>i) Minimum 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. Minimum consultancy fee</p> <p>ii) More than 3 projects having INR 2 Cr. minimum.</p>	IDFC	<p>As per the Technical Qualification Criteria, the bidders are required to submit completion certificates for all the projects proposed to claim experience. We request you to kindly alter this clause to seek work orders also in the absence of completion certificates to claim</p>	In case completion certificate is not there, other documentary evidence of having carried out the study with contact details of entity for which the study was carried out may be given for verification.

					experience.	<p>i) Minimum 3 projects having INR 1 Cr. Consultancy fee.</p> <p>ii) More than 3 projects having INR 1 Cr. minimum.</p> <p>iii) International assignments in Tourism having INR 5 Cr. minimum consultancy fee.</p> <p>iv) Cruise Tourism projects with more than INR 1 Cr. consultancy fee.</p>
	3.10.4	16	Last Date of Submission of RFP-29/09/6/2016	IDFC	We request you to kindly extend the last date for submission of bids by 3 weeks from the date of providing clarifications to our queries.	Last date extended to 11 th July, 2016.
8.	3.5 (e)	12	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	This clause is restrictive in nature. This is an invitation for all international and national participants. By restricting experience in Asia will not make any value addition to this assignment. However the same provision will restrict many good firms in Europe and America from participation. We request the authority to delete the provision for experience in Asia.	The provision of Asia has been amplified to include Europe and America. The clause may be read as "The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr".
	3.5	13	In case of consortium, the Team Leader should be from the Lead Member. Further, the rest of the experts should be on the rolls of the sole member/any of the consortium members. The consultant will estimate the requirement of support staff.	Meghraj Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	"All the experts should be from sole member/any of the consortium members/individual or firm. The consultant will estimate the requirement of the support staff".	Not agreed

	3.5 (f)	12	Average annual turnover of the Bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy services (i.e., 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) shall be at least Rs. 50 Crores. A Certificate from a Chartered Account (As per format prescribed in Annexure 2) along with audited financial statements shall be furnished. (In case audited financial statements are not available for year 2015-16, an undertaking on the bidder's letterhead shall be submitted along with unaudited financials)	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	Average annual turnover provision is high. This should be 1% of the value of project or equivalent to the value of the assignment. We request the authority to reduce this value to a proportionate value to ensure quality participation.	Not agreed
	3.5 (g).3	13	Infrastructure Expert/ Transport planner (having experience in port planning)	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	Transport Planner with experience in port planning is rare. Similar is the case for Master's in Infrastructure planning with experience in port infrastructure. We request you to relax these criteria to a graduate engineer with experience in design and development of port infrastructure.	Not agreed
	3.5(g).4	13	B. Arch. With a minimum of 10 years of professional experience in designing ports/ terminals.	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	Very few Architects are involved in designing of ports. We request you to amend this cause to include engineers as well.	Not agreed
	3.6.(B).1	14	Relevant work experience of the firm: Number of completed consultancy projects (Compulsory Submission of Completion certificate along with the proposal)	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	We request you to relax the compulsory submission of completion certificate as in many cases the same is not issued by the client. Instead other relevant documents such as copy of agreements may be accepted.	In case completion certificate is not there, other documentary evidence of having carried out the study with contact details of entity for which the study was carried out may be given for verification.

	3.10.4	16	Schedule of Bidding Process Last date of submission of RFP – 29/06/2016	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	Considering the above queries we request you to extend the last date of submission of RFP to another 15 days after the issuance of response to queries and addendum if any.	Last date extended to 11 th July, 2016.
	4.13	24	IPA shall retain by way of performance security (the “Performance SECURITY”), 10% (ten per cent) of all the amount due and payable, under the study, to the Consultant in the form of Bank Guarantee or Demand Draft, to be appropriated against breach of the Agreement or for recovery of liquidated damages. The Bid security of the successful Applicant can be adjusted towards Performance Security. The performance security shall be retained till the successful completion of the contract.	Meghraj Capital Advisors Pvt. Ltd.	Instead of retaining 10% of all amount due, we request to collect a performance security at the time of signing of the contract.	Performance security equivalent to 10% of the contract agreement, for which bank guarantee or demand draft should be provided to IPA for appropriation against breach of the Agreement or for recovery of liquidated damages. It shall be retained till successful completion of the contract.
9.	3.5 (e)	12	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia having minimum consultancy value of INR 2 Cr.	PWC	Request Ministry of Shipping (MoS) to clarify the minimum number of international projects to qualify for in the same. Also in our experience, the most profitable circuits internationally would be covered in USA, Europe and the Mediterranean circuit. Kindly request you to consider the above international circuits outside India apart from Asia.	The Bidder should have experience of providing consultancy services for atleast cruise tourism related project in Asia, America and Europe having minimum consultancy value of INR 1 Cr.
	3.5 (f)	12	“Average annual turnover of the Bidder in the last three financial years from consultancy services (i.e., 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) shall be at least Rs. 50 Crores. A Certificate from a Chartered Account (As per format prescribed	PWC	Owing to a requirement of a large operational network of international and national experts and professionals for delivering this project fruitfully, we request MoS to raise the turnover of the firm by 500 Cr.	Not agreed

			in Annexure 2) along with audited financial statements shall be furnished. (In case audited financial statements are not available for year 2015-16, an undertaking on the bidder's letterhead shall be submitted along with unaudited financials)"			
	3.5 (g).1.	12	Management Graduate (MBA) with minimum of 15 years of professional experience in tourism sector. Must have relevant experience in Coastal/ Cruise tourism, tourism circuit development with an Exposure of international assignments in similar domain.	PWC	Request MoS to consider and revise professional experience from 15 years in tourism sector to strategy consulting experience with significant experience in tourism sector. Alternately request MoS to consider Team Leader position from consortium partner or a key industry expert who is sub consultant/ associate with the lead firm but not a full time employee.	Not agreed
	3.6.(B).1. (iii)	15	International assignments in tourism having INR 5 Cr minimum consultancy fee	PWC	Request MoS to supply with the minimum number of projects and the point breakup for the same.	Details of minimum 3 relevant projects may be provided for evaluation.
	3.6.B.1.(iv)	15	Cruise Tourism projects with more than INR 2 Cr minimum consultancy fee	PWC	Request MoS to supply with the minimum number of projects and the point breakup for the same.	Minimum 3 projects with consultant fee of Rs. 1 Cr.
	3.10.(4)	16	Last date of submission of RFP – 29/06/2016 – 15:00 Hrs	PWC	Given the large scope of the project, we would require to have both Indian and International experience on board for the project. For the same we need to bring our pool of experts to finish the project successfully. Hence request you to extend the timeline by 2 weeks to provide you with the relevant projects.	Last date extended to 11 th July, 2016.

5.2 Deliverable 2	28	Identification of existing and potential National (including convergence with Inland Waterways Plan)/ International Routes/Circuits with a potential of Cruise Tourism with Indian Territory as base point/ turnaround ports. Priority shall be given to identification of circuits connecting various islands of India and the mainland which have untapped potential of attracting domestic and international tourists	PWC	Request MoS to provide us with a threshold value for the number of international and national circuits so that we can estimate the workload better.	5 Cruise Circuits each for Domestic, International and River Cruise have to be identified. Other circuits which have potential may also be listed.
5.2 Deliverable 3	29	Development of Conceptual Model Terminal Design with all modern amenities i.e. Passenger amenities, service counters, shopping areas, restaurants, cafeteria, medical clinic, Internet café, Laundromat, Entertainment centers, tour operators/ship agents offices , miscellaneous facilities & parking and complimentary facilities such as marinas, helipads, sea parks, aquarium etc.	PWC	Our understanding is that we need to develop an overall high level terminal design plan with block estimates for various aspects of the design. The same would be later used or converted to a project specific detailed architectural design which is currently not included in this scope. Kindly clarify are we correct in our understanding.	Yes
5.2 Deliverable 3	29	“Detailed financial analysis by development of financial model, capturing value of Cruise Tourism, with various scenarios for the cost and revenue streams, to ascertain financial viability of Cruise Tourism Terminal development including possible off-season engagement such as convention center.”	PWC	Our understanding is that the financial analysis is to be carried out for minimum 4 ports separately. Please clarify if we are correct in our understanding.	Yes

	5.2 Deliverable 4	30	Identification of specific domestic, international and River cruise circuits that would be taken up for development immediately, in medium term and long term. This should include the present infrastructure and other facilities and the gaps to be filled. Recommending competitive and reasonable (i) tax and duties and (ii) port docking charges in line with international standards.	PWC	Our understanding is that there is a threshold number of circuits and routes to be identified for the Indian, International and river cruise circuits. Kindly Enhance our understanding with the threshold number.	5 Cruise Circuits each for Domestic, International and River Cruise have to be identified. Other circuits which have potential may also be listed.
	5.2 Deliverable 4	30	Preparation of Detailed Integrated Marketing Communication Strategy to promote India as World Class Cruise Destination globally as well as in domestic market. Preparation of marketing strategy to attract players to introduce cruise tourism in India.	PWC	Our understanding is that we would only be involved in a Detailed Marketing Plan and not involved in roping in investment related activities. Kindly clarify if our understanding is correct.	Yes, the consultant is to prepare detailed marketing plan.